## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA CHARLESTON DIVISION

B.P.J., by her next friend and mother, HEATHER JACKSON, Plaintiff,

v.

Civil Action No. 2:21-cv-00316 Honorable Joseph R. Goodwin, Judge

WEST VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION, HARRISON COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION, WEST VIRGINIA SECONDARY SCHOOL ACTIVITIES COMMISION, W. CLAYTON BURCH in his official capacity as State Superintendent, and DORA STUTLER in her official capacity as Harrison County Superintendent, Defendants,

And

LAINEY ARMISTEAD, Defendant-Intervenor.

## MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF WVSSAC'S MOTION IN LIMINE TO PRECLUDE USE OF HARRISON COUNTY'S 30(B) TESTIMONY OUTSIDE SCOPE

Now comes West Virginia Secondary School Activities Commission (WVSSAC), by counsel, Roberta F. Green, Kimberly M. Bandy, Shannon M. Rogers and Shuman McCuskey Slicer PLLC, and, pursuant to Federal Rules of Evidence 105, 401-03, and Federal Rules of Civil Procedure Rule 30(b), moves the Court for an order in *limine* to preclude use of Superintendent Dora Stutler's testimony beyond the scope of her designation when and to the extent that said testimony addresses WVSSAC. Superintendent Stutler was deposed as the 30(b)(6) witness representing the Harrison County Board of Education on a portion of the topics identified by Plaintiff.<sup>1</sup> However, in the course of the deposition, several topics designated for a different 30(b)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See, e.g., ECF No. 184. See also ECF No. 289-17.

witness were addressed to Superintendent Stutler over the objections of counsel.<sup>2</sup> Thereafter, Superintendent Stutler testified not only to WVSSAC operations incorrectly,<sup>3</sup> but also testified to them in a manner that was later contradicted by the County's 30(b) witness designated to address the issue.<sup>4</sup> Superintendent Stutler also was invited to speculate as to WVSSAC operations under HB 3293,<sup>5</sup> which, by order of this Court has not gone into effect at this time (such that any procedures for any individual or entity have yet to be determined).<sup>6</sup> The inconsistencies and complications with Superintendent Stutler's testimony were noted and somewhat clarified at that time:

```
21 Q Hello, Superintendent Stutler. This is
```

22 Roberta Green with WVSSAC -

\* \* \*

2 Q -- and I'm here on behalf of WVSSAC, and I

3 recollect that you had testified to some issues

4 relative to their eligibility rules, their processes

5 and any processes they have in place relative to 04:58:15

6 3293.

7 Do you recollect that testimony?

8 A Yes.

9 Q And as you sit here, do you actually defer to

10 WVSSAC as probably more informed and knowledgeable 04:58:31

11 as to their processes?

12 A Repeat that question.

13 Q Would you defer to WVSSAC as being more

14 knowledgeable about WVSSAC policies --

15 MS. REINHARDT: Objection. 04:58:48

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> ECF No. 289-17 at 80-81:

<sup>19</sup> MS. DENIKER: Well, I object to that because

<sup>20</sup> I believe that topic 8 is in the context of House 03:06:06

<sup>21</sup> Bill 3293. You're asking general questions with

<sup>22</sup> regard to the relationship between Harrison County

<sup>23</sup> Board of Education and the WVSSAC, which I believe

<sup>24</sup> are within the scope of topic 10. I -- I understand

<sup>25</sup> topic 8 to be in the context solely of House Bill 03:06:23

Page 81

<sup>1 3293.</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> ECF No. 289-17 at 143 (testifying to an 'automatic pull' from WVEIS).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> ECF No. 289-17 at 214.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> ECF No. 289-17 at 82-83;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> ECF No. 67.

16 MS. DENIKER: Objection to the form.

17 BY MS. GREEN:

18 Q -- than you would be?

19 A Yes.

\* \*

5 BY MS. GREEN: 04:59:38

6 Q All right. Well, you know, would you

7 defer -- Superintendent, would you defer to WVSSAC

8 as being potentially more knowledgeable about their

9 rules, how their rules work and -
10 MS. REINHARDT: Same objection. 04:59:48

10 MS. KEINHARDT. Same object

11 BY MS. GREEN: 12 Q -- the preparations are pursuant to 3293, if

13 any?

14 MS. REINHARDT: Same objection.

15 MS. DENIKER: Objection to the form. 05:00:00

16 THE WITNESS: If you're saying they're more

17 knowledgeable, yes.<sup>7</sup>

Whereas a 30(b) witness must be prepared to testify to what is reasonably known by a corporate or other entity,<sup>8</sup> the parties effected by topics and testimony beyond the designee's reasonable ken should not be held to that testimony.<sup>9</sup> Whereas WVSSAC could undertake the same questioning at trial, inviting the witness to defer to WVSSAC yet again, the less confusing approach and that most likely to avoid waste of the Court's and advisory jury's time would be to limit the 30(b) witness's testimony as indicated at the deposition and above.

Therefore, for these reasons, WVSSAC requests an order in *limine*, whereby the Harrison County Board of Education would defer to WVSSAC to testify to its rules, regulations and internal processes generally and as relates to HB 3293.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> ECF No. 289-17 at 151-52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Zeng v. Elec. Data Sys. Corp., 2007 U.S. Dis. Lexis \*13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Fed. R. Evid. 105.

WEST VIRGINIA SECONDARY SCHOOL ACTIVITIES COMMISSION, By Counsel.

# /S/ Roberta F. Green

Roberta F. Green (WVSB #6598)
Kimberly M. Bandy (WVSB #10081)
Shannon M. Rogers (WVSB # 13920)
SHUMAN MCCUSKEY SLICER PLLC
Post Office Box 3953 (25339)
1411 Virginia Street East, Suite 200 (25301
Charleston, WV 25339
(304) 345-1400
(304) 343-1826 FAX
rgreen@shumanlaw.com
kbandy@shumanlaw.com
srogers@shumanlaw.com

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA CHARLESTON DIVISION

B.P.J., by her next friend and mother, HEATHER JACKSON, Plaintiff,

v.

Civil Action No. 2:21-cv-00316 Honorable Joseph R. Goodwin, Judge

WEST VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION, HARRISON COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION, WEST VIRGINIA SECONDARY SCHOOL ACTIVITIES COMMISION, W. CLAYTON BURCH in his official capacity as State Superintendent, and DORA STUTLER in her official capacity as Harrison County Superintendent, Defendants,

And

LAINEY ARMISTEAD, Defendant-Intervenor.

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I, Roberta F. Green, have this day, the 22nd day of June, 2022, served a true and exact copy of the foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF System, which will send notification of such filing to the following counsel of record:

Loree Beth Stark Nicholas Ward ACLU of WV FOUNDATION 1614 Kanawha Boulevard, East Charleston, WV 25311 lstark@acluwv.org nward@acluwv.org Kathleen R. Hartnett
Julie Veroff
COOLEY LLP
101 California St. – 5<sup>th</sup> Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111-5800
khartnett@cooley.com
jveroff@cooley.com

Katelyn Kang COOLEY LLP 55 Hudson Yards New York, NY 10001-2157 kkang@cooley.com

Andrew Barr COOLEY LLP 1144 15<sup>th</sup> St., Suite 2300 Denver, CO 80202-5686 abarr@cooley.com

Joshua Block Chase Strangio ACLU FOUNDATION 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004 jblock@aclu.org

Sruti Swaminathan LAMBDA LEGAL 120 Wall St., 19<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10005 sswaminathan@lambdalegal.org

Kelly C. Morgan
Michael W. Taylor
Kristen Vickers Hammond
BAILEY & WYANT, PLLC
500 Virginia St., East, Suite 600
Charleston, WV 25301
kmorgan@baileywyant.com
mtaylor@baileywyant.com
khammond@baileywyant.com

Douglas P. Buffington, II Curtis R.A. Capehart Jessica A. Lee State Capitol Complex Building 1, Room E-26 Charleston, WV 25305-0220 Curtis.R.A.Capehart@wvago.gov Elizabeth Reinhardt COOLEY LLP 500 Boylston St., 14<sup>th</sup> Floor Boston, MA 02116-3736 ereinhardt@cooley.com

Avatara Smith-Carrington LAMBDA LEGAL 3500 Oak Lawn Ave., Suite 500 Dallas, TX 75219 asmithcarrington@lambdalegal.org

Carl Charles
LAMBDA LEGAL
1 West Court Square, Suite 105
Decatur, GA 30030
ccharles@lambdalegal.org

Susan Llewellyn Deniker
Jeffrey M. Cropp
STEPTOE and JOHNSON, LLC
400 White Oaks Boulevard
Bridgeport, WV 26330
susan.deniker@steptoe-johnson.com
jeffrey.cropp@steptoe-johnson.com

Tara Borelli
LAMBDA LEGAL
1 West Court Square, Suite 105
Decatur, GA 30030
tborelli@lambdalegal.org

David C. Tryon West Virginia Atty. General's Office 1900 Kanawha Blvd., E. Bldg. 1, Rm 26E Charleston, WV 25305 David.C.Tryon@wvago.gov Taylor Brown American Civil Liberties Union 125 Broad St., 18<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10004 tbrown@aclu.org

Jonathan Scruggs
Roger Greenwood Brooks
Alliance Defending Freedom
15100 N. 90<sup>th</sup> Street
Scottsdale, AZ 85260
jscruggs@adflegal.org
rbrooks@adflegal.org

Timothy D. Ducar Law Offices of Timothy D. Ducar, PLC 7430 E. Butherus Drive, Suite E Scottsdale, AZ 85260 tducar@azlawyers.com

Anthony E. Nortz Kesner & Kesner 112 Capitol Street Charleston, WV 25301 anortz@kesnerlaw.com

Aria S. Vaughan
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Rights Division
Educational Opportunities Section
950 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
4CON, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor
Washington, DC 20530
aria.vaughan@usdoj.gov

Brandon S. Steele
Joshua D. Brown
Law Offices of Brandon S. Steele
3049 Robert C. Byrd Drive, Ste 100
Beckley, WV 25801
bsteelelawoffice@gmail.com
joshua brown05@hotmail.com

Christiana Holcomb
Rachel Csutoros
Alliance Defending Freedom
440 First Street NW, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20001
cholcomb@adflegal.org
rcsutoros@adflegal.org

Meredith Taylor Brown American Civil Liberties Union 125 Broad Street, 18<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10004 tbrown@aclu.org

Michael W. Taylor BAILEY & WYANT PLLC 500 Virginia St., E. – Suite 600 Charleston, WV 25301 mtaylor@baileywyant.com

Fred B. Westfall, Jr.
Jennifer M. Mankins
United States Attorney's Office
300 Virginia Street, East – Rm. 400
Charleston, WV 25301
fred.westfall@usdoj.gov
jennifer.mankins@usdoj.gov

# /S/ Roberta F. Green

Roberta F. Green, Esquire (WVSB #6598) SHUMAN MCCUSKEY SLICER PLLC Post Office Box 3953 (25339) 1411 Virginia Street E., Suite 200 (25301) Charleston, West Virginia (304) 345-1400; FAX: (304) 343-1826 Counsel for Defendant WVSSAC rgreen@shumanlaw.com